

Quarterly Report of the usTLD Stakeholder Council - Q4 2014

Overview

In September 2014, the following individuals were appointed to the usTLD Stakeholder Council following a public request for Expressions of Interest:

- *Bobby Flaim, Federal Bureau of Investigation*
- *Bryan Britt, Beltane Web Services*
- *Chris Mead, American Chamber of Commerce Executives*
- *Doug Robinson, National Association of State Chief Information Officers*
- *Elisa Cooper, MarkMonitor*
- *James Bladel, GoDaddy*
- *Karen Rose, Internet Society*
- *Linda Kinney, Motion Picture Association of America*
- *Michele Neylon, Blacknight Solutions*
- *Patrick Post, National Small Business Association*
- *Peter Roman, Department of Justice*
- *Philip Corwin, Virtualaw LLC*
- *Scott Blake Harris (Chair), Harris, Wiltshire & Grannis LLP*
- *Shane Tews (Vice Chair), American Enterprise Institute*
- *Tom Barrett, EnCirca*

Q4 2014 marked the commencement of the work of the usTLD Stakeholder Council (“Council”) through the establishment of a Council List Serve and two teleconference meetings. An archive of Council discussions on the Council List Serve is publically available [here](#).

Significant progress was made during Q4 2014 to develop foundational documents that would guide future Council work including the usTLD Stakeholder Council Work Plan and the usTLD Stakeholder Council Operating Procedures. The Council is also in the process of developing a high-level policy agenda to guide its deliberations in the coming months, informed by input from each councilor during the first Council meeting and a forthcoming policy survey.

Notwithstanding, all work of the Council will continue to be subject to the policies and procedures established in the [usTLD Stakeholder Council Charter](#). Both documents were published for a thirty-day public comment period.

The Council also held elections to appoint its Chair and Vice Chair. Scott Blake Harris and Shane Tews stepped forward to serve the roles of Chair and Vice Chair, respectively. Both

candidates were unopposed and unanimously supported by the Council to serve as its officers. The Council Chair and Council Chair will each serve an initial 1-year term, deemed to commence in January 2015, and will be eligible for reelection.

Council Recommendations

The usTLD Stakeholder Council did not provide any formal recommendations to Neustar or the Department of Commerce during Q4 2014.

Other Informal Input Provided

The usTLD Stakeholder Council did not provide any other informal input to Neustar or the Department of Commerce during Q4 2014.

Summary of Topics Under Council Consideration

Council Work Plan and Council Operating Procedures

During Q4 2014 a draft of the Council Work Plan and Council Operating Procedures were prepared. Both documents were put forward for a thirty-day public comment period, both of which began on December 15, 2014 and conclude on January 14, 2015.

The Work Plan provides a schedule of meetings for the Council, as well as arrangements for publically posting agendas and minutes for each meeting. The Work Plan also establishes a reporting schedule for the provision of Quarterly Reports. Lastly, the Work Plan establishes a schedule for public consultation that establishes a deadline for holding the 2015 usTLD Public Stakeholder Town Hall, and a schedule finalizing that date.

The Operating Procedures are intended to supplement, but not replace or conflict with the usTLD Stakeholder Council Charter in guiding the Council in its deliberations and work. The operating procedures are intended to be lightweight in nature and to feature maximal transparency and openness in all council activities. At a high-level, the Operating Procedures provide for the following:

- *Opening all Council meetings for active public participation;*
- *Publishing agendas and minutes for all Council Meetings;*
- *Maintaining a public archive of discussions on the Council List Serve;*
- *Publishing all Council Recommendations and Reports;*
- *Providing a thirty-day Public Comment Period for all Council recommendations, as well as for other issues or input that the Council deems would benefit from Public Comment;*
- *Electing Council Officers on an annual basis (with the possibility of reelection of existing officers);*
- *Establishing initial terms (i.e. two- or three-year terms) by random generation; and*
- *Establishing a system of majority voting for all Council recommendations, as well as the publication of the results of any vote.*

All input received during the Public Comment Periods will be summarized and taken into account by the Council in preparing its Final Work Plan and Final Operating Procedures. The Final Work Plan will be provided to the Department of Commerce no later than February 11, 2015 and subsequently adopted by the Council.

Kids.us Education Advisory Committee Final Report

The Council commenced discussion and consideration of the Final Report of the Kids.us Education Advisory Committee, beginning with background information on the kids.us namespace and the Final Report, by Stephanie Duchesneau and Tom Barrett, both of whom had participated in the deliberations of the Advisory Committee. There was across-the-board support by the council for the Advisory Committee's principal recommendation: to maintain the suspension of the kids.us namespace.

The Council also discussed the feasibility of repealing the Dot Kids Implementation and Efficiency Act, which had brought the namespace into existence, to permanently remove the kids.us namespace or undertake significant changes to the requirements for the namespace, rather than maintaining it in its suspended form. It was generally agreed that due to Congress's lack of attention to or interest in changing the legislation, as well as the minimal requirements associated with maintaining the suspension, efforts were better devoted to advancing similar goals elsewhere in .US.

The Council concluded its second meeting with the agreement that consideration of the Final Report and efforts to advance positive experiences for youth in .US were important topics that would require further deliberation.

Summary of Meetings

November 10, 2014 Meeting

The Council Secretariat provided an overview of the purpose and goals of the usTLD Stakeholder Council. Beth Bacon described the role that the NTIA would be playing in Council Activities. Each Councilor described his or her background and interests in the .US Namespace. Councilors each provided suggestions for potential topics, policies, or other projects that the Council could take on. Suggestions included:

- *Carve outs to proxy and privacy restrictions for U.S.-based membership organizations, particularly those that could sponsor registrations on behalf of youth;*
- *Modifications to the Nexus Policies, to align with USPTO policies related to defining legitimate commercial interests and activity; and*
- *Promotions to target medium and small businesses, as well as importers and exporters.*

The call concluded with an overview of council elections and the Council list serve, to be established by the Council Secretariat.

December 8, 2014 Meeting

The group unanimously approved Scott Blake Harris and Shane Tews as the Chair and Vice Chair of the Council. The group reviewed the Draft Work Plan and Draft Operating Procedures that had been circulated by the Council Secretariat. Two modifications were incorporated to extend the default comment period to thirty days for all Council Recommendations, and to establish a date for the 2015 Annual usTLD Public Stakeholder Town Hall by January, to facilitate planning and publication of the details. The Council then discussed the Final Report of the Kids.us Education Advisory Committee.

Summary of Public Comments

usTLD Stakeholder Council Work Plan

During Q4 2014, the Council opened a thirty-day public comment period on the [usTLD Stakeholder Council Work Plan](#) (“Work Plan”) on the [council website](#).

The public comment period opened on December 15, 2014 and will close on January 14, 2015.

As of December 31, 2014 no comments have been received.

usTLD Stakeholder Council Operating Procedures

During Q4 2014, the Council opened a thirty-day public comment period on the [usTLD Stakeholder Council Operating Procedures](#) (“Operating Procedures”) on the [council website](#). The public comment period opened on December 15, 2014 and will close on January 14, 2015.

As of December 31, 2014 comments have been received.

Deadlines for Q1 2015

Deadline	Deliverable/Action
January 16, 2015	Stakeholder Council to set and publish date for 2015 Annual usTLD Public Stakeholder Town Hall
February 11, 2015	Neustar to submit Final Council Work Plan to the Department of Commerce for review
February 18, 2015*	Council to adopt and publish final Work Plan and Operating Procedures *Deadline subject to Department of Commerce agreement to Final Work Plan and Operating Procedures

March 21, 2015	Secretariat to prepare draft Q1 2015 Stakeholder Council Quarterly Report for internal review
April 30, 2015	Stakeholder Council to provide Q1 2015 Quarterly Report to the Department of Commerce

Appendix

Appendix A: Draft usTLD Stakeholder Council Work Plan

Schedule of Meetings

The usTLD Stakeholder Council will meet once every four (4) weeks, starting on Monday, November 10, 2014 at 3:00p.m. Eastern Time.

The schedule of calls of the usTLD Stakeholder Council will be as follows:

- November 10, 2014 at 3:00p.m. ET
- December 8, 2014 at 3:00p.m. ET
- January 5, 2015 at 3:00p.m. ET
- February 2, 2015 at 3:00p.m. ET
- March 2, 2015 at 3:00p.m. ET
- March 30, 2015 at 3:00p.m. ET
- April 27, 2015 at 3:00p.m. ET
- May 25, 2015 at 3:00p.m. ET
- June 22, 2015 at 3:00p.m. ET
- July 20, 2015 at 3:00p.m. ET
- August 17, 2015 at 3:00p.m. ET
- September 14, 2015 at 3:00p.m. ET
- October 12, 2015 at 3:00p.m. ET*
- November 9, 2015 at 3:00p.m. ET
- December 7, 2015 at 3:00p.m. ET
- January 4, 2016 at 3:00p.m. ET
- February 1, 2016 at 3:00p.m. ET

**Neustar will circulate a poll to determine whether to reschedule this call closer to the date, as it coincides with the Columbus Day holiday.*

The secretariat will circulate to the usTLD Stakeholder Council list serve and publish on the Council website an agenda for each call the week prior to the call.

The secretariat will circulate to the usTLD Stakeholder Council list serve and publish on the Council website the meeting minutes within one week of that meeting.

Reporting

Beginning in January, 2015 the usTLD Stakeholder Council will publish a quarterly report summarizing all Council activities from the foregoing quarter.

Neustar will develop a draft report and circulate it to the usTLD Stakeholder Council no less than ten (10) days prior to the end of each calendar quarter, which will be subject to the following deadlines:

- December 21, 2014
- March 21, 2015
- June 20, 2015
- September 20, 2015
- December 21, 2015

The usTLD Stakeholder Council will review and provide any input to the report on the first Stakeholder Council call of the following quarter, currently scheduled as follows:

- January 5, 2015
- April 27, 2015
- July 20, 2015
- October 12, 2015
- January 4, 2016

Councilors may also provide input into the quarterly reports at any time through the usTLD Stakeholder Council list serve or by contacting the secretariat. Neustar will incorporate Council feedback and produce a Final Quarterly Report. The Final Report will be approved by the Council Chair and Vice Chair before it is published and submitted to the Department of Commerce, which shall occur by the last day of the first month of each calendar quarter, as follows:

- January 31, 2015
- April 30, 2015
- July 31, 2015
- October 31, 2015
- January 31, 2016

Schedule for Public Consultation

usTLD Public Stakeholder Town Hall

The usTLD Stakeholder Council will hold one annual usTLD Public Stakeholder Town Hall to allow the broader community of stakeholders to provide input and feedback on .US Policies and other initiatives. The 2015 usTLD Town Hall will be held no later than April 12, 2015.

The usTLD Stakeholder Council will establish a date and time for the first usTLD Stakeholder Town Hall, during its January 5, 2015 meeting and the date and time will be published on the Council website and .US Policy Blog by the conclusion of the following week (January 16, 2015). The meeting will be scheduled with sufficient lead time to allow outreach to the community of usTLD Stakeholders.

Within 45 days of the usTLD Public Stakeholder Town Hall the, usTLD Stakeholder Council will produce an Annual Report, no later than May 27, 2015.

Appendix B: Draft usTLD Stakeholder Council Operating Procedures

Establishment of Policy Agenda

Topics will be brought forward for consideration by the Council in accordance with the following procedures established in the Guidelines for Council Deliberations set forth in its [Charter](#).

To facilitate the identification of topics of particular interest to Stakeholder Council, Neustar will circulate a poll shortly following the December 8, 2014 Stakeholder Council call. The poll will allow councilors to indicate their level of interest in various potential discussion topics for council consideration. The survey will be designed to be open-ended with the intention of opening up discussion on a broad range of possible Council activities.

The results of the poll, including additional topics raised by individual Councilors, will be published for a thirty (30) day public comment period, to allow the broader usTLD community to raise additional matters of interest and potential consideration by the usTLD Stakeholder Council.

Council Work Plan

The secretariat will maintain a Work Plan on the Stakeholder Council Resource Page.

Deadlines for key Council deliverables including Quarterly Reports, Annual Reports, and the usTLD Stakeholder Council Town Hall are established in the .US contract.

Meetings Policy

The usTLD Stakeholder Council will initially meet on a monthly basis, following the meetings schedule established in the usTLD Stakeholder Council 14-month Work Plan. Meetings will be conducted in accordance with the transparency procedures outlines below.

As needed, any member of the usTLD Stakeholder Council may request that an additional meeting be held or that a meeting be canceled or rescheduled by notifying the Council Chair and Secretariat. It will be at the Chair's discretion whether changes to the schedule of meetings are warranted; if modifications to the schedule of meetings are deemed necessary, the Chair will work with the secretariat to schedule the meeting and to update the Council Work Plan accordingly.

Transparency Procedures

Council Meetings and Calls

All calls will be open to the public. Dial in details for each call will be included in each meeting agenda, as well as in the Council Work Plan, both of which will be published on the Council

website. Participants that are not members of the usTLD Stakeholder Council may participate actively in the calls, however, votes or polls will be limited to members of the usTLD Stakeholder Council.

The usTLD Stakeholder Council secretariat will publish on the Council website agendas and minutes from each Stakeholder Call. Calls will be recorded and archived on the Council website.

Agendas will be published and circulated the week prior to Stakeholder Council calls

Council List Serve

The secretariat will manage a council list serve to facilitate Council discussions between meetings. All members of the usTLD Stakeholder Council will be able to post to the list which will be sent to all councilors and archived.

Archives will be available to the public [here](#); non-members will not have posting rights.

Council Recommendations

Following the completion of public consultation procedures and consideration of public comments by the Stakeholder Council, approved recommendations will be published on the Stakeholder Council Resource Page. The published recommendations will include, at minimum:

- The recommendation(s) being put forward;
- A summary of public comments received and any actions that were taken in response to the Public Comment Period;
- The outcome of any votes taken (if applicable).

Quarterly Reports

The usTLD Stakeholder Council will publish a quarterly report summarizing all Council activities from the foregoing quarter. Quarterly reports will include, but are not limited to providing:

- A summary of all council meetings from the following quarter;
- Any recommendations or other input provided by the usTLD Stakeholder Council during that quarter and the decision-making procedures that were followed, including the outcomes of any votes that were taken;
- A summary of input received during any public consultation processes undertaken by the usTLD Stakeholder Council; and
- Changes to council members or council officers.

Procedures for Public Consultation

Public Comment Procedures

All formal policy recommendations by the usTLD Stakeholder Council that are determined by Neustar to fall properly within the purview of council activities will be published on the [Stakeholder Council Website](#) for a thirty (30)-day public comment period.

Informal input by the council need not be published for public comment; however, a public comment period may be initiated at the discretion of the Council Chair.

The Stakeholder Council may also choose to open up a public comment period on any topic that it determines requires broader public input.

At the conclusion of any public comment period the .US Secretariat will prepare a report for the Stakeholder Council summarizing all public comments received no later than ten (10) days following the conclusion of the Public Comment period. The Stakeholder Council will consider the report of Public Comments at its subsequent meeting and determine whether any revisions to the recommendation should be made as a result of public comments received.

usTLD Public Stakeholder Town Hall

The usTLD Stakeholder Council will hold one annual usTLD Public Stakeholder Town Hall to allow the broader community of stakeholders to provide input and feedback on .US Policies and other initiatives. Participation in the usTLD Public Stakeholder Town Hall will permit remote participation. The Town Hall will be open to the Public. Neustar and Councilors will engage in promotional efforts to solicit participation in the Town Hall.

usTLD Annual Report

Within forty-five (45) days of the usTLD Public Stakeholder Town Hall the usTLD Stakeholder Council will produce an Annual Report. The contents of the Annual Report will include, at minimum:

- A summary topics covered during the usTLD Public Stakeholder Town Hall;
- A list of attendees;
- Feedback received from the public; and
- Any future actions or discussions that the Committee plans to take as a result of feedback received.

Election Procedures

The Chair and the Vice Chair will be jointly responsible for setting the policy agenda for meetings of the usTLD Stakeholder Council in collaboration with the council Secretariat, as well reviewing and approving Council reports or other documentation prepared by the secretariat before they are published.

The Chair will also be responsible for running meetings of Council; the Vice Chair will assume these duties in the event that the Chair is unable to participate in a meeting of the Council.

Neither party will be entitled to speak for the usTLD Stakeholder Council except where policies, positions, or other initiatives have been previously approved by the Council in accordance with the procedures established in the usTLD Council Charter and Operating Procedures.

The Chair and Vice Chair will each be elected for a one year term. Chairs and Vice Chairs will each be eligible for reelection for up to two one-year terms, depending upon the term length of the Chair and Vice Chair. In the event the Chair or Vice Chair has served a partial term to fill a vacancy, he or she will still be eligible for up to two reelections.

In the event that the Chair is no longer able to continue his or her duties before the conclusion of the term, the Vice Chair will assume the role of Chair and the Council will be responsible for appointing a Vice Chair to fill the remaining term. In the event that the Vice Chair is no longer able to perform his or her duties the Council will be responsible for appointing a Vice Chair to fill the remaining term.

Elections must be conducted prior to the end of each calendar year and terms for the Council Chair and Council Vice Chair will commence on the first date of each calendar year.

Initial terms will be deemed to have commenced on January 1, 2015.

Term Limits

Councilors will be appointed in accordance with the procedures for Selection and Term of Council Members established in the [Council Charter](#). Terms will commence on the first day of the calendar year.

A Councilor may express his or her interest in serving an additional term by notifying the Chair and the secretariat. Councilors may be reelected by a majority vote of the Council.

The term length for initial councilors (i.e. two or three years) will be set by the secretariat using a random generation tool. The secretariat will retain and keep up-to-date a list of all current councilors and their terms.

Initial terms will be deemed to have commenced on January 1, 2015.

Voting Procedures

The Council will generally seek to work by Consensus, however, any Councilor may request that a vote be taken on any policy recommendation or piece of input and such request shall be granted. If a vote is called, then a majority of Councilors must vote in favor of the Recommendation in order for the recommendation to proceed. All votes will be conducted transparently and reflected in the final Policy Recommendation. Any vote shall require a quorum of fifty percent of the Stakeholder Council.

Informal polls may also be taken from time to time to gauge the level of support for a position. Such polls shall not be considered votes and will not be reflected in the final recommendation. No quorum shall be required for such polls.

Appendix C: Minutes of the November 11 Meeting of the usTLD Stakeholder Council

Becky Burr provided background about the formation of the usTLD council. In the earlier days, the usTLD had launched a similar initiative, however, at the time, multi-stakeholder policy-making structures were less common and the project was short lived. The idea of reinstating a Stakeholder Council for .US was put forward in the 2013 .US Rebid. The Council will work to identify different stakeholders' goals and priorities for the .US namespace and then to develop policies that help address these needs and interests.

Ms. Burr emphasized that the Draft Charter and Guiding Principles & Policies provided to Councilors in advance of the call were meant to serve as strawmen to initiate discussion. The Council would be welcome to consider modifications to these guidelines as a part of its work. It was also stressed that the 14-month Workplan was to be developed by the Council, including issues and projects beyond those proposed by Neustar for initial consideration.

Ms. Burr and Stephanie Duchesneau introduced themselves and described the roles that they would be playing as the secretariat for the Council. Councilors introduced themselves and described their affiliations, as well as their history with and interests in .US.

Several councilors also touched on considerations that they believed should play into Council activities. James Bladel suggested that the Council should look into why there was lower adoption by Americans of .US than other citizenries of their local country-code, and how to drive engagement. Shane Tews echoed this goal saying that the Council should be looking into how to engage Americans around .US at local and regional levels. Linda Kinney stated her interest in balancing the goals of free expression and creating a lawful environment in .US.

Beth Bacon introduced herself and thanked councilors for volunteering their time; Ms. Bacon also described how the NTIA would be acting as an observer to Council calls and other activities.

Ms. Burr initiated a discussion of the high-level goals of the council including representing the needs and interests of the wide range of stakeholders for the usTLD; suggesting enhancements to the space; fostering a stable and lawful environment including ensuring respect for property and security, stability, and resiliency; and fostering a safe and user-friendly experience for users of the usTLD. She suggested targeting youth, in particular, to help build a generation of Internet users who regard .US as their online home.

Ms. Burr and Ms. Duchesneau provided an overview of the Conflicts of Interest Policy, which was circulated to members in advance of the call. It was stressed that Neustar, in its Charter and list of notional councilors, had sought out Councilors with a direct stake and interest in the namespace; financial interests in .US policies and operations were not meant to preclude participation, provided that they were properly disclosed in the form circulated within the call. Ms. Burr also suggested that Council activities should be fully open and transparent including opening up calls and publishing meeting agendas and minutes.

The Council moved into a discussion of possible policies or projects for consideration by the council. Ms. Burr suggested possible carve outs to the prohibition on privacy or proxy registrations where select, trusted membership organizations could provide such services on behalf of their memberships; the American Girl Scouts were raised as an example of an organization that could sponsor registrations to encourage older scouts to register domains and build websites in .US. Consideration of the Nexus Policy and possible modifications thereto, such as for trademark holders with marks registered with the USPTO, were raised as a means to make .US a useable space for foreign users with legitimate commercial interests in the United States. Promotional opportunities for registrars that were willing to sponsor low-cost registrations for target communities presented as a possible initiative.

Consideration of the report of the Kids.us Education Advisory Committee was presented as an early responsibility of the Council. Ms. Duchesneau and Mr. Barrett provided an overview of the goals, composition, and work of the Education Advisory Committee. Ms. Duchesneau described the group's ultimate recommendation to maintain the suspension of the kids.us namespace but to continue work to foster safe, positive, and educational experiences for kids within .US, taking into account the operating procedures and potential use cases identified by the Kids.us Education Advisory Committee.

The Council was asked to brainstorm other possible policies, projects, and target audiences for council work. Scott Blake Harris suggested that the committee consider the release of two-character labels within .US. Linda Kinney recommended the development of best practices for ccTLD operators. Bryan Britt recommended that the goal of service to the local communities, businesses, and markets be prioritized. Chris Mead and Patrick Post both echoed support for work to engage medium and small businesses; Mr. Post added that a good target would also be importers and exporters. Phil Corwin recommended that the Council consider the effects of the new gTLD program on .US, and whether the program meant increased competition or acted as an opportunity to promote .US as an attractive choice in an environment where .COM was no longer regarded as the default option. Mr. Barrett suggested that local governments were another possible outreach group; in response, Doug Robinsion raised NASCIO's recommendation that these governments move their web presences to .GOV addresses.

Ms. Burr stated that the council would be electing a Chair and a Vice Chair through online voting and that Ms. Duchesneau would be circulating further details on elections.

Michele Neylon asked whether an email distribution would be set up for the Council. Ms. Duchesneau responded that she would be setting up a distribution. Ms. Burr added that a work space would also be made available to publish council materials.

Action Items

- *Stephanie Duchesneau to circulate meeting minutes and further instructions for Chair and Vice Chair elections to be conducted electronically.*
- *Stephanie Duchesneau to create a distribution email for future council discussions.*
- *All councilors to complete Declaration of Interest form circulated by Stephanie Duchesneau.*

- *Stephanie Duchesneau and Becky Burr to develop a first draft of a 14-month Council Work Plan for input by the group, inclusive of topics raised on the inaugural call and in discussion in forthcoming weeks.*

Appendix D: Minutes of the December 8 Meeting of the usTLD Stakeholder Council

Stephanie Duchesneau took a roll call and requested that all Councilors complete their Statements of Interest by Friday, December 12. Ms. Duchesneau reminded the Council that one of the priorities in filling the council seats was to get representatives with particular interests in .US, as reflected in the notional council list and that having interests in .US, financial or otherwise, is not problematic provided that such interests are properly disclosed. At the request of the Council, Ms. Duchesneau said that she would recirculate the link to complete the SOI. Ms. Burr said that the secretariat would soon be circulating an open-ended policy survey to help gauge Councilors' interest in particular policy topics.

Ms. Burr provided an update on the Stakeholder Council elections. The secretariat received one Expression of Interest for Chair by Scott Blake Harris and one for Vice Chair by Shane Tews. Neither officer position received more than one expression. Ms. Burr stated that if any councilors had concerns with either of the nominations that they should raise them on this call, but recommended that, otherwise, the Council should proceed with acclaiming Mr. Harris and Ms. Tews for the respective roles. Linda Kinney seconded the call to acclaim Mr. Harris and Ms. Tews for the positions of Chair and Vice Chair. Several councilors voiced their support for the two nominees, and Mr. Harris and Ms. Tews were approved as Chair and Vice Chair, respectively. Ms. Burr thanked Mr. Harris and Ms. Tews for volunteering to serve as Council officers.

Discussion moved to the Draft Work Plan and Draft Operating Procedures that had been circulated to the council the previous week. Ms. Burr mentioned that both documents were intended to be lightweight and reaffirmed that the Draft Work Plan and Draft Operating Procedures were both meant to be Council-developed documents and that the first cuts that were circulated by the secretariat were fully open to modification by the Council.

Ms. Duchesneau provided a brief review of the Draft Operating Procedures. At a high-level the Draft Operating Procedures were designed to maximize transparency in all Stakeholder Council activities including: publishing all council recommendations for public comment; opening Council meetings for public participation; maintaining a publically-accessible archive of the Council list serve; and publishing agendas, minutes, and recordings.

Michele Neylon stated his support for the practice of opening up public comment periods on Stakeholder Council recommendations, but recommend that the group provide a period of longer than fourteen days, as initially suggested in the Draft Operating Procedures. Mr. Neylon suggested that, instead, a thirty-day comment period should be provided to give stakeholders adequate time to develop comments, but also to allow Neustar and the Council to conduct outreach on the comment periods. Several Councilors voiced their support for lengthening the comment period to thirty days and Ms. Duchesneau volunteered to update the draft accordingly. Ms. Burr added that the group should review the Draft Operating Procedures and feel free to provide further input and discussion over the Council list serve.

Bryan Britt asked about the role of the council and the weight that would be given to Council recommendations in updating policies for the usTLD. Ms. Burr responded that the Stakeholder Council was not a formally-constituted Advisory Council and that the Department of Commerce would retain the final say in changes to policies for .US. Ms. Burr emphasized that the Department of Commerce was fully supportive and encouraging of the introduction of multi-stakeholder mechanisms within the 2014 .US rebid and that she believed that Council recommendations would be taken very seriously by the Department of Commerce in policy development and implementation for .US.

Ms. Duchesneau provided a review of the Draft Council Work Plan, which reflected the position taken on the previous call that the Council would, initially, meet once every four weeks in accordance with the schedule established in the poll following that call. She described the obligatory Council deliverables including Quarterly Reports of Council activities and the annual usTLD Town Forum.

Mr. Harris suggested that the Town Hall should be scheduled earlier than February 12, as reflected on the draft deliverables schedule, and that two months lead time should be provided to plan the Town Hall and recruit participant; he suggested that, instead, the Town Hall be scheduled during the Council's January meeting. Several members of the Council voiced their support for this suggestion. Ms. Duchesneau stated that she would update the Draft Work Plan to reflect that the Council would set a date for the Town Hall during the January 5 meeting.

Karen Rose asked about what recruitment strategies would be undertaken to ensure robust registrant participation during public comment periods and in the Town Hall. Ms. Burr responded that Neustar hoped to leverage its registrars with whom registrants have a direct relationship, to encourage participation, as well as the networks of members of the Stakeholder Council.

Mr. Neylon asked whether .US had a social media presence. Jeff Neuman responded that the primary twitter handle for .US was @aboutdotus, which could potentially be used to promote Council initiatives; Ms. Duchesneau added that in recruitment for the Council she had used this handle, as well as LinkedIn and industry press and forums to publicize the Council, strategies which could also be used by the council on an ongoing basis.

Ms. Duchesneau provided an overview of the Report of the Kids.us Education Advisory Committee. The Education Advisory Committee was constituted to provide recommendations related to the continued suspension of kids.us. The Kids.us third-level namespace was created in 2002 with the goal of being a walled garden where all content would be safe for children aged thirteen and under. The namespace not only had a strict set of policies delineating types of content that were prohibited in the space, but also a requirement that content be reviewed before it was put up and an expedient review and takedown process for any content deemed to be infringing.

By the time that Neustar requested the suspension of the namespace in 2011 there were only 651 domain names registered in the namespace and only six active websites; further, each of these sites had a more robust presence elsewhere on the web. These trends suggested that the

web had evolved in such a way that it was no longer feasible to confine kids' internet usage to a single, walled-off corner of the web.

The Education Advisory Committee was convened to consider whether there were any potential uses of the .US space that could function within the existing policy framework, as well as to brainstorm other initiatives within .US that could serve similar goals. The Committee explored several possible use cases, before determining that the policy framework would be too restrictive and would work against the success of any initiative and that the group's efforts were better focused on initiatives to promote positive experiences for kids elsewhere in .US. This decision was also informed by the failure of other walled gardens, even those that were well funded and supported through strong content partnerships. The Education Advisory Committee's primary recommendation was that the kids.us zone remain suspended, however, the group also provided operating procedures and several possible use cases that Neustar might explore to advance similar goals elsewhere within .US. Ms. Duchesneau added that the Stakeholder Council might consider taking up this goal or any of the possible initiatives described in the report, given that youth engagement was one of the areas of high Council interest during the first call.

A question was asked about whether the group had also considered efforts to change the policy framework for kids.us. Mr. Neuman responded that there exist significant obstacles to changing the framework; as the space originated due to an act of Congress in 2002, congressional signoff would, likewise, be required to change the policy framework. Ms. Duchesneau added that, due to these complexities, the group had focused principally on initiatives within the existing policy guidelines or, otherwise, elsewhere in .US with changes to the policy framework being only a tertiary consideration.

Ms. Tews asked whether Neustar had any ongoing responsibilities with respect to the namespace. Mr. Harris responded that today the namespace is suspended, an option provided for directly within the legislation that created kids.us; he added that should the namespace again become active that all of its preexisting policies and requirements would spring back into existence. Mr. Neuman added that Neustar continued to provide a required annual report to Congress describing the state of the namespace.

Philip Corwin asked whether Neustar had engaged with congressional representatives to seek out support for changing the legislation. Ms. Burr responded that though effort to engage on this matter had occurred around the time that the zone was suspended that she believed Council efforts and energy might be better focused around supporting positive experiences for kids elsewhere in the namespace than upon changing legislation; Mr. Harris supported this assessment stating that there was little interest by Congress in the namespace or in undertaking the work needed to preserve it.

Bryan Britt stated that the evolution of the web had generally gone against proprietary spaces of this kind, adding that the issues at stake in the kids.us discussion were complicated and would likely require more discussion and attention from the Council than could be provided on the first call. The Council discussed kids.us and agreed that between the failed experience of kids.us, specifically and of walled gardens more generally that the zone should remain suspended. Ms.

Duchesneau said that she would circulate the full report of the Education Advisory Committee to the Council for further consideration.

With no further business the Stakeholder Council concluded its first call. The Council moved into a discussion of possible policies or projects for consideration by the council. Ms. Burr suggested possible carve outs to the prohibition on privacy or proxy registrations where select, trusted membership organizations could provide such services on behalf of their memberships; the American Girl Scouts were raised as an example of an organization that could sponsor registrations to encourage older scouts to register domains and build websites in .US. Consideration of the Nexus Policy and possible modifications thereto, such as for trademark holders with marks registered with the USPTO, were raised as a means to make .US a useable space for foreign users with legitimate commercial interests in the United States. Promotional opportunities for registrars that were willing to sponsor low-cost registrations for target communities presented as a possible initiative.

Consideration of the report of the Kids.us Education Advisory Committee was presented as an early responsibility of the Council. Ms. Duchesneau and Mr. Barrett provided an overview of the goals, composition, and work of the Education Advisory Committee. Ms. Duchesneau described the group's ultimate recommendation to maintain the suspension of the kids.us namespace but to continue work to foster safe, positive, and educational experiences for kids within .US, taking into account the operating procedures and potential use cases identified by the Kids.us Education Advisory Committee.

The Council was asked to brainstorm other possible policies, projects, and target audiences for council work. Scott Blake Harris suggested that the committee consider the release of two-character labels within .US. Linda Kinney recommended the development of best practices for ccTLD operators. Bryan Britt recommended that the goal of service to the local communities, businesses, and markets be prioritized. Chris Mead and Patrick Post both echoed support for work to engage medium and small businesses; Mr. Post added that a good target would also be importers and exporters. Phil Corwin recommended that the Council consider the effects of the new gTLD program on .US, and whether the program meant increased competition or acted as an opportunity to promote .US as an attractive choice in an environment where .COM was no longer regarded as the default option. Mr. Barrett suggested that local governments were another possible outreach group; in response, Doug Robinson raised NASCIO's recommendation that these governments move their web presences to .GOV addresses.

Ms. Burr stated that the council would be electing a Chair and a Vice Chair through online voting and that Ms. Duchesneau would be circulating further details on elections.

Michele Neylon asked whether an email distribution would be set up for the Council. Ms. Duchesneau responded that she would be setting up a distribution. Ms. Burr added that a work space would also be made available to publish council materials.

Action Items

- *Stephanie Duchesneau to recirculate an updated link to the SOI form*

- *Councilors to complete SOI form by **January 12***
- *Stephanie Duchesneau to update Draft Operating Procedures to reference thirty-day public comment period*
- *Stephanie Duchesneau to update Work Plan to determine Town Hall dates at January 5 meeting*
- *Stephanie Duchesneau to circulate report of Kids.us Education Advisory Committee*
- *Stephanie Duchesneau to circulate policy survey*
- *Councilors to complete policy survey before January 5 meeting*